

MR. K. PADMANABHAN (*Chirayinkil I*). May I know from the member whether the Surgeon in charge received any remuneration from the patient?

RAO SAHIB DR. N. KUNJAN PILLAI (*Chief Secretary to Government*): Yes.

MR. K. PADMANABHAN (*Chirayinkil I*): May I know from the member whether that remuneration has been ordered to be refunded?

RAO SAHIB DR. N. KUNJAN PILLAI (*Chief Secretary to Government*): No.

*Malpractice in the Women and Children's Hospital,
Taikad.*

228. *MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Anbala uzha I*): Will the Government be pleased to state:

(a) whether any case of medical malpractice was reported to them in regard to in-patients admitted to the Women's Hospital at Taikad;

(b) if so, whether the question was investigated; and

(c) what is the result of the investigation; if any?

RAO SAHIB DR. N. KUNJAN PILLAI (*Chief Secretary to Government*): (a), (b) and (c) It is not possible to furnish the information required by the member, as no period has been specified.

*Death of an in-patient in the Women and Children's
Hospital.*

229. *MR. A. S. DAMODARAN ASAN (*Mavelikara*): Will the Government be pleased to state:

(a) whether the Chief Secretary has received a memorial dated 8th January 1934 from one K. R. Das praying for an inquiry into the circumstances in which his wife, Ponnammamma, died in the Women and Children's Hospital on 20-12-1933 and the conduct of some of the Doctors and Midwives attending upon that patient;

(b) whether a copy of the same would be laid on the table; and

(c) whether any action has been taken on the same?

RAO SAHIB DR. N. KUNJAN PILLAI (*Chief Secretary to Government*):

(a) Yes.

(b) No.

(c) Yes.

MR. A. S. DAMODARAN ASAN (*Mavelikara*): With regard to the answer to part (c), may I know what action has been taken?

RAO SAHIB DR. N. KUNJAN PILLAI (*Chief Secretary to Government*): I have answered it already, Sir. I have said that the answer is confidential.

PRESIDENT: This question has been repeated and repeated in the course of the few questions that were asked on this matter.

MR. A. S. DAMODARAN ASAN (*Mavelikara*): I beg to submit a point for the consideration of the Chair. It has been ruled on the first day of the meeting that it is the Chair that has to decide whether when a question is asked the reply called for is confidential. Here we have been hearing a number of allegations most scandalous to the State against a particular department and responsible officers in that department and in this representative institution members are asking for certain information. Even the punishment that is meted out to the culprits is withheld as confidential. I request the Chair to see that the prestige of the Assembly is established by asking the Government members to give proper answers.

PRESIDENT: The Chair has already given that undertaking and it will certainly investigate into the matter. Before we re-assemble, the Chair may come to some decision on the matter.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha I*): May I know from the member under what provision of the Legislative Council Rules or Standing Orders the answer is withheld?

PRESIDENT: I have already promised to look into the matter.

MR. K. PADMANABHAN (*Chirayinkil I*): May I know from the member the names of the particular individuals on whom action was taken?

RAO SAHIB DR. N. KUNJAN PILLAI (*Chief Secretary to Government*): I think I cannot disclose the names until the Chair directs otherwise.

MR. PUTHUPALLI S. KRISHNA PILLAI (*Quilon II*): May I know from the member whether the punishment offered to the various individuals falls within the four walls of the recognised forms of punishment?

RAO SAHIB DR. N. KUNJAN PILLAI (*Chief Secretary to Government*): If the Honourable member will define the four walls of the recognised forms of punishment, I will be able to answer the question.

MR. PUTHUPALLI S. KRISHNA PILLAI (*Quilon II*): There are fines imposed—

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Torvala*): On a point of order, whether the member can be allowed to enumerate all the forms of punishment.

PRESIDENT: Mr. Krishna Pillai, you cannot ask the member to specify the nature of the punishment when so long we have been under the impression that the punishment has been treated as confidential.

MR. PUTHUPALLI S. KRISHNA PILLAI (*Quilon II*): May I know whether the known forms of punishment fines, suspension, dismissal, compulsory retirement, taking of leave preparatory to retirement—were meted out in this instance? I want to know whether the punishment awarded was within or without these recognised forms—for instance were they kicked or lynched or were they let off without any punishment. If the former, I do not want an answer.

PRESIDENT: I am afraid the question has not been put in proper form. It is not in keeping with the dignity of the House that a member should be permitted to ask whether a subordinate was lynched, and I overrule it.

MR. PUTHUPALLI S. KRISHNA PILLAI (*Quilon II*): I beg your pardon, Sir, and I withdraw the statement. I may submit that I stated these forms of punishment because I was asked to define what the four walls of the recognised forms of punishment are.

PRESIDENT: That of course is alright. But you cannot go further than that.

RAO SAHIB DR. N. KUNJAN PILLAI (*Chief Secretary to Government*): Either any one or more of these forms of punishment, Sir.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha I*): May I know from the Government member whether they have considered this case as fit to be taken up for enquiry under the Departmental Enquiries Regulation?

RAO SAHIB DR. N. KUNJAN PILLAI (*Chief Secretary to Government*): No.

Complaints against the staff of the Women and Children's Hospital.

230. *MR. A. S. DAMODARAN ASAN (*Mavelikara*): Will the Government be pleased to state:

(a) whether the Dewan has received a memorial dated 13-3-1934 from one K. R. Das regarding the necessity to conduct an efficient and impartial inquiry into the conduct of some of the Doctors of the Women and Children's Hospital in the treatment of the wife of the memorialist;

(b) whether a copy of that memorial would be placed on the table; and

(c) whether any action has been taken on the same?

RAO SAHIB DR. N. KUNJAN PILLAI (*Chief Secretary to Government*):

(a) Yes.

(b) No.

(c) Yes.

MR. K. PADMANABHAN (*Chirayinkil I*): With reference to part (c), may I know whether the action taken was in accordance with the rules prescribed by the T. S. R?

RAO SAHIB DR. N. KUNJAN PILLAI (*Chief Secretary to Government*): I do not think there is anything in the T. S. R. prescribing the punishment to be inflicted on the subordinate officers.

MR. K. PADMANABHAN (*Chirayinkil I*): To the question whether any action has been taken on the same the Honourable member said 'yes'. I would like to know whether the action taken is in accordance with the rules prescribed for such by the T. S. R.

RAO SAHIB DR. N. KUNJAN PILLAI (*Chief Secretary to Government*): Sir, there are no rules prescribed in the T. S. R. for taking action on this particular matter.

MR. K. PADMANABHAN (*Chirayinkil I*): May I know from the Honourable member whether the T. S. R. does not make it obligatory on the officers investigating such matters to obtain explanations?